Dealing with Citizen-centric Social News

A Behavioral View

Panelists
Drs. Serpil Tokdemir Yuce, Stephan Böhm, and Nitin Agarwal

Moderator
Nitin Agarwal
Panelists

Dr. Serpil Tokdemir Yuce is research project analyst at the Office of Medicaid Inspector General (OMIG), Little Rock, Arkansas, USA. Dr. Yuce has a joint affiliation with COSMOS, UALR as research associate. Her work involves extracting raw data from Fraud and Abuse Detection System (FADS), cluster analysis, anomaly/outlier detection, predictive analysis and decision support systems, data visualization, content mining, and network analysis. Dr. Yuce obtained her PhD from UALR in 2015 with support from U.S. National Science Foundation (NSF). Bringing together the computational modeling and social science theories, her dissertation explored the role of social media in coordinating online collective action in the context of Saudi Arabian Women's right to gender equality. She obtained her B.S. degree in Computer Science from Marmara University, Istanbul, Turkey in 2003. She completed her Masters Degree (MS) in Computer Science Department from Georgia State University in 2006, Atlanta, Georgia, USA.
Panelists

Dr. Stephan Böhm is a Professor of Telecommunications and Mobile Media at the Faculty of Media Management at the RheinMain University of Applied Sciences. Professor Böhm is a co-founder of the Center for Advanced E-Business Studies (CAEBUS) in Wiesbaden and of the Mobile Media Forum, an annual conference on mobile media technologies and applications, in Germany. He teaches on media technology and media management topics in bachelor and master programs and is a visiting professor at the International College of the NIDA in Bangkok, Thailand. Professor Böhm is the author of more than 50 articles and a member of the program committees of several international academic conferences. His current research work focuses on Innovation Management and Marketing, Technology Acceptance for Mobile Applications and Services, Up-front User Research for Mobile Applications, Mobile Prototyping, Mobile HCI. Before joining Rhein-Main University of Applied Sciences in 2006, he worked for the leading strategy and technology consulting firm Booz Allen Hamilton in Berlin and Dusseldorf.
Panelists

Dr. Nitin Agarwal is a distinguished professor and Maulden-Entergy endowed chair of information science at University of Arkansas at Little Rock. He is also the Director of the Collaboratorium for Social Media and Online Behavioral Studies (COSMOS). His research includes, social computing, deviant behavior modeling, mis/disinformation dissemination, computational propaganda analysis, group dynamics, social-cyber forensics, data mining, and privacy. His research has been supported by NSF, ARO, ONR, AFRL, DARPA, DHS with a total funding of over $10 million. He is an IARIA fellow. He received his doctorate at Arizona State University in 2009 with outstanding dissertation recognition and was recognized as top 20 in their 20s by Arkansas Business. He has published over 100 peer-reviewed articles with several best paper awards.
WOMEN’S RIGHT TO DRIVE: SPILLOVER OF BROKERS, MOBILIZATION, AND CYBERACTIVISM

Serpil Tokdemir Yuce

Postdoctoral Research Associate - University of Arkansas at Little Rock
Research Project Analyst – Office of Medicaid Inspector General
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research is funded in part by the National Science Foundation's Social Computational Systems (SoCS) and Human Centered Computing (HCC) programs (Award Numbers: IIS-1110868 and IIS-1110649) and the US Office of Naval Research (Grant number: N000141010091).

- Project website: [http://oca.lab.asu.edu/](http://oca.lab.asu.edu/)
OUTLINE

- Introduction: History of Women’s Rights Campaigns
- Analysis
- Discussion
INTRODUCTION

- (ICTs) – such as social media:
  - people interact, communicate, share information and how they entertain themselves

- Cyberspace – individuals within a community who were formerly unequipped for discovering their voices are presently fit to better organize and coordinate with one another through numerous Internet-based media.

- Arab Spring, the Occupy and other recent movements:
  - Spread messages, organize, and mobilize support for their campaigns.
INTRODUCTION – CONT...

- YouTube, Twitter, Facebook, and blogs:
  - Utilized to assist the protesters in spreading messages, organizing, and mobilizing support for their causes
  - Female Muslim population in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia

- Saudi women face some of the most inequitable laws and practices when compared to international standards, including the prohibition of driving motorized vehicles

- Denied freedom of expression forced them to deploy active political uses of social media
As a consequence, the diffusion and spread of mobile information technology is nothing short of a social revolution in the daily lives of Saudi women where they are conducting most of their efforts on various social media platforms in terms of campaign organizations, mobilizations, and support.
INTRODUCTION – CONT.
INTRODUCTION – CONT.
INTRODUCTION – CONT.
INTRODUCTION – CONT.
In Saudi Arabia, women began to see a significant amount of progress on the issue of women’s rights during the reign of King Abdullah.
Although the issue of women driving is considered a social taboo, there is no official law banning in it.

When asked about the official position, the government has repeatedly stated that this is a social issue.
Oct26Driving Campaign

- Best-organized social campaign ever seen in Saudi Arabia
- A group of Saudi women activists launched an online petition website (www.oct26driving.com) on September 25, 2013
  - “The 26th October Campaign”
- >16,000 signatures
- The campaign website was hacked on October 9, 2013 that led to a surge in Twitter activity
- The online initiative was boosted by the fact that residents of Saudi Arabia are highly active on social media, especially Twitter and YouTube
Oct26Driving Campaign

- Twitter: #oct26driving
Oct26 Driving Campaign

- Eman al-Nafjan (@Saudiwoman), an organizer
  - more than 100 women have gotten behind the wheel
- Since political activism has no history in Saudi Arabia, Al-Nafjan stated that their strategy is “to keep marching on and to see if people join or not”
ANALYSIS

- Our study examines the networks of three campaigns during 2013 of the ongoing Saudi women’s Right to Drive movement:
  - ‘Oct26Driving’,
  - ‘Nov31Driving’, and
  - ‘Dec28Driving’
- Examine the *emergence, evolution, and development of spillover effects* among those three campaigns
ANALYSIS

- Role of social media in facilitating cyber-collective actions.
- How individual sentiment(s) and Twitter hashtags as markers
  - diffuse between social movements,
  - form coalitions and bridging between social movements, and
  - shapes spillover between social movements
ANALYSIS

- We looked for answers for the following research questions:
  - Who are the bridging nodes in the networks and
  - How does their brokerage give direction to the diffusion of ideas through interrelated social movements?
The findings of this study are conceptualized to shed new insights on
- information diffusion,
- mutual influence,
- role distribution analysis of activists/supporters across movements and
- provide a deeper understanding of interconnected social movements and social movement spillover.
**Discussion**

- Saudi Arabia announced that it would allow women to drive, ending a longstanding policy that has become a global symbol of the oppression of women in the ultraconservative kingdom.

- The change, which will take effect in June 2018, was announced in a royal decree read live on state television and in a simultaneous media event in Washington.
Discussion – cont...

_Saudi Arabia Agrees to Let Women Drive_

By BEN HUBBARD  SEPTEMBER 26, 2017

A woman behind the wheel in Saudi Arabia in 2013. The kingdom said on Tuesday that women would be allowed to drive starting in June. Faisal Al Nasser/Reuters

Discussion – cont...

Ms. Hathloul tweeted a simple reaction to the news: “Thank god.”

Manal al-Sharif, a Saudi women’s rights advocate who filmed herself driving in 2011 and posted the footage to YouTube to protest the law, celebrated the announcement on Tuesday.

Ms. Sharif was instrumental in organizing groups of women for collective protests to demand an end to the ban on female drivers. She was arrested at the time for taking part in the actions, and later wrote a book about her experience. She now lives in Australia.

But despite celebrating the success for female drivers, she said the next campaign would be to end guardianship laws.
https://nyti.ms/2yyQYjg

THANK YOU!

QUESTIONS???
Dealing with Citizen-centric Social News: A Behavioral View

CENTRIC
October 11, 2017
Athens, Greece
So What is “Citizen-centric Social News”?

The principle of citizen centricity insists that neither the product nor its technology, but the users ('citizens' in case of public service delivery processes) have to be the nuclei of the design strategy. (Malhotra 2015)

Source: https://www.igi-global.com/chapter/a-design-framework-for-evolving-a-citizen-centric-information-society/135841
Citizen-centricity is about Putting Citizens in the Center

Governments move through four stages to become citizen centric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citizen neutral</th>
<th>Citizen aware</th>
<th>Citizen motivated</th>
<th>Citizen centric</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strategy</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No clearly defined strategy for anticipating citizen needs</td>
<td>Citizen needs acknowledged</td>
<td>Citizens seen as primary strategic element</td>
<td>Citizens at the center of strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-term strategy but no long-term vision</td>
<td>Partial link between strategies and objectives</td>
<td>Clear, consistent link between strategies and objectives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crisis-influenced decision making</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organization</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No team to manage citizen relationships</td>
<td>Limited resources to handle citizen concerns</td>
<td>Citizen service desk with clearly defined roles</td>
<td>Central citizen relationship team across divisions with well-defined roles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No collaboration or information sharing with other organizations</td>
<td>Limited collaboration and information sharing with other organizations</td>
<td>Collaboration and information sharing with other organizations</td>
<td>Maximum collaboration and information sharing with other organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No KPIs to measure service performance</td>
<td>Some elements of service KPIs measured but not systematically tracked</td>
<td>Consistent tracking of some elements of service KPIs</td>
<td>Well-defined and disclosed service performance KPIs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Processes</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No process for receiving and analyzing citizen feedback</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Systems</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No use of media, social media, Internet, or other mechanisms to communicate with citizens</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: KPIs are key performance indicators. Source: A.T. Kearney analysis

*Strategy.* The organization has a clear, well-defined strategy for becoming citizen centric.

*Organization.* The organization is citizen focused; dedicated teams review citizen feedback and performance is measured consistently against strategic objectives.

*Processes.* Processes are designed to involve citizens and businesses and to anticipate their evolving needs.

*Systems.* Citizen feedback is systematically captured and analyzed via social media and the Internet; communications with citizens takes place in real time.

In Journalism Citizen-centricity is about Getting Involved

“The Mission: To expose abuses of power and betrayals of the public trust by government, business, and other institutions, using the moral force of investigative journalism to spur reform through the sustained spotlighting of wrongdoing.”

Source: ProPublica Website

Source: https://www.propublica.org/getinvolved/
Crisis of Trust in Traditional Journalism in Germany (1/2)

"Those who scream "Lie press" don't just want to see their opinion in the media, but only their opinion. "Lie press" is the call for an authoritarian society."

Sascha Lobo,
German Blogger and Author

37 percent of the German audience believe that lies are frequent in media.

42 percent believe that there are political directives for media reporting.

Source: https://www.infratest-dimap.de/umfragen-analysen/bundesweit/umfragen/aktuell/glaubwuerdigkeit-der-median/
Opinion Influencing and Distortion in Social Media

Bessi/Ferrara 2016: Social Bots Distort the 2016 US Presidential Election Online Discussion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bot specific statistics</th>
<th>Top 50K users (exact)</th>
<th>Extrapolation for the full population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td># Bot-generated tweets</td>
<td>2,330,252 (18.45%)</td>
<td>~ 3.8M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># Human-generated tweets</td>
<td>10,303,251 (81.55%)</td>
<td>~ 17M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># Bots</td>
<td>7,183 (14.4%)</td>
<td>~ 400K</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># Humans</td>
<td>40,163 (80.3%)</td>
<td>~ 2.2-2.3M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># Unknown</td>
<td>2,654 (5.3%)</td>
<td>~ 150K</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3. Bot-specific statistics for the top 50 thousand users (ranked by activity) and extrapolation for the full population.


Figure 3: Geocoded sources for bots (left) and human-generated (right) tweets.

Transformation of Media: Broadcasting follows Social

“We interrupt this program for an urgent Twitter from Washington...”

## Top Influencer: Ranking of Twitter Accounts by Followers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Username</th>
<th>Followings</th>
<th>Followers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>KATY PERRY (@katyperry)</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>104,915,258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Justin Bieber (@justinbieber)</td>
<td>311,045</td>
<td>102,088,080</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Barack Obama (@BarackObama)</td>
<td>627,642</td>
<td>95,723,194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Taylor Swift (@taylorswift13)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>85,596,714</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Rihanna (@rihanna)</td>
<td>1,130</td>
<td>79,782,770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Ellen DeGeneres (@TheEllenShow)</td>
<td>36,022</td>
<td>74,291,818</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>xoxo, GaGa (@ladygaga)</td>
<td>128,853</td>
<td>71,840,273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>YouTube (@YouTube)</td>
<td>1,020</td>
<td>70,080,271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Justin Timberlake (@timberlake)</td>
<td>253</td>
<td>62,330,624</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Twitter (@Twitter)</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>62,000,911</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Differences between Broadcasting and Social Media (1/2)

Traditional news broadcasting (1-to-many): all recipients get the same content.

Source of pictures: Wikimedia Commons, https://commons.wikimedia.org
Differences between Broadcasting and Social Media (2/2)

How Does Facebook Choose What To Show In News Feed?

News Feed Visibility = * I × P × C × T × R

- **Interest**: Interest of the user in the creator
- **Post**: This post’s performance amongst other users
- **Creator**: Performance of past posts by the content creator amongst other users
- **Type**: Type of post (status, photo, link) user prefers
- **Recency**: How new is the post

* This is a simplified equation. Facebook also looks at roughly 100,000 other high-personalized factors when determining what’s shown.

Source: [https://techcrunch.com/2014/04/03/the-filtered-feed-problem/](https://techcrunch.com/2014/04/03/the-filtered-feed-problem/)
Differences by Type of Social Media

## Social media news user profiles

### % of each social media site’s news users who are...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Media Platform</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Facebook</th>
<th>YouTube</th>
<th>Twitter</th>
<th>Instagram</th>
<th>Snapchat</th>
<th>LinkedIn</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### By Age Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Facebook</th>
<th>YouTube</th>
<th>Twitter</th>
<th>Instagram</th>
<th>Snapchat</th>
<th>LinkedIn</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18-29</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-49</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-64</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65+</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### By Education Level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education Level</th>
<th>Facebook</th>
<th>YouTube</th>
<th>Twitter</th>
<th>Instagram</th>
<th>Snapchat</th>
<th>LinkedIn</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High school or less</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some college</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College+</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### By Ethnicity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Facebook</th>
<th>YouTube</th>
<th>Twitter</th>
<th>Instagram</th>
<th>Snapchat</th>
<th>LinkedIn</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nonwhite</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Tumblr, Reddit, and WhatsApp not shown. Nonwhite includes all racial and ethnic groups, except non-Hispanic white.

Source: Survey conducted Aug. 8-21, 2017. "News Use Across Social Media Platforms 2017"
Thank you for your attention.

Prof. Dr. Stephan Böhm
RheinMain University of Applied Sciences
Media Management
Unter den Eichen 5
65195 Wiesbaden, Germany

stephan.boehm@hs-rm.de
When Citizen Journalism Goes Rogue

Prof. Dr. Nitin Agarwal
Maulden-Entergy Endowed Chair and Distinguished Professor of Information Science
Collaboratorium for Social Media and Online Behavioral Studies (COSMOS)
University of Arkansas-Little Rock
nxagarwal@ualr.edu
Social Media and Citizen Journalism


- Krums, Janis (January 15, 2009). "There's a plane in the Hudson. I'm on the ferry going to pick up the people. Crazy". TwitPic.

- Sometimes Citizens Journalism is good.
Social Media and Citizen Journalism

• The Concept of “Citizen Journalism” is when “public citizens play an active role in the process of collecting, reporting, analyzing, and disseminating news and information”

• When people get their news from “social media” instead of “mainstream media”, irresponsible Citizen Journalism can pose a danger to society if it misrepresent facts and information.
Why does it matter?

- Many people trust news that comes from their friends circle on social media channels
  - 34% Americans trust the information they get from social media (Pew Research Center, 2016).
  - 14% Americans consider social media as the most important source of information (the National Bureau of Economic Research (NBER), 2017).
Fake News Factories – The Business Model

- Running a fake-news campaign is cheap:
  - For $55,000 you could discredit a journalist;
  - For $200,000 you might instigate a street protest.
  - For $30 an 800-word fake news article, written by Chinese content marketer Xiezuobang
  - For $621 a video appears in YouTube’s main page for two minutes, created by Russian firm SMOService
  - For $25 to have 2,500 Twitter followers all retweet a link for you, using the English-language firm Quick Follow Now.

Source: Cyber security firm Trend Micro, 2017
Memes and Fake News
Cross-Media Dissemination

A YouTube channel with several Anti-NATO propaganda videos. The channel is called, “ANTI NATO”.

A blog using YouTube video to spread anti-NATO propaganda suggesting NATO’s troops obstructing Russian operations in Syria thereby helping ISIS.

A blog using YouTube video to spread anti-NATO propaganda by suggesting NATO is waging war against Syrian refugees.
A brand new search engine...

Good Gopher
The search engine for independent news and information

Learn what makes Good Gopher the search engine for independent news and information.

Some of the independent news websites included in GoodGopher:

- NaturalNews.com
- NewsTarget.com
- TruthStreamMedia.com
- ActivistPost.com
- TruthWiki.org
- TheBlaze.com
- Twitchy.com
- LewRockwell.com
- PoliticalTracker.com
- OffGridSurvival.com
- TenthAmendmentCenter.com
- TheEconomicCollapseBlog.com
- Breitbart.com
- Infowars.com
- Trump.news
- WashingtonTimes.com
- GrassrootsLiberty.com
- FreedomWorks.org
- TheLibertyBeacon.com
- IntelliHub.com
- SurvivalBlog.com
- TheDailySheeple.com
- TrueActivist.com
- WesternJournalism.com
- DrudgeReport.com
- FukushimaWatch.com
- GovtSlaves.info
- TheSleuthJournal.com
- EyeOpening.info
- LibertyBlitzkrieg.com
- NoMoreFakeNews.com
- NutritionalAnarchy.com
- RightSideNews.com
- WhatReallyHappened.com
Motivation to Study the Blogosphere

- Blogosphere gives citizens the power and freedom to express their opinion, frame narratives more effectively than any other social media platform.
- Because blogs:
  - Have no characters limit.
  - Have no censorship.
  - And provide digital town halls.

Technorati, 2011
Blog tracking tools: Due to the complexity and inefficiency of blog data collection many blog tracking tools have shutdown.

- Blogs do not have APIs
- The pages structure change a lot
- Its unstructured data

Blog Monitoring Tools

Blog tracking tools: Due to the complexity and inefficiency of blog data collection many blog tracking tools have shutdown.

- Blogs do not have APIs
- The pages structure change a lot
- Its unstructured data
Blogtrackers Tool

Blogtrackers database has:
• 264 blog sites
• 18 locations
• 308,685 blog posts
• 47 languages
• 5,454,807 entities (people, places, organizations, etc.)
• Earliest post from February 1993
• Last crawled post from July 2017

Blogtrackers Available at:
• http://blogtrackers.host.ualr.edu/

Case Study 1: 2014 Ukraine-Russia Conflict

- Graham W. Phillips is a British journalist and blogger.
- He went to Ukraine to cover the voice of Ukrainians during Euromaidan.
- He reported that Ukrainians are “happy” with the previous pro-Russian government of Ukraine.
- He used Vlogging to cover the events.
- His Vlogs made him an influential blogger & an enemy to the current Ukrainian government so they banned him from entering Ukraine for three years.
- Once he was banned from entering Ukraine he went to Russia instead of going back to England.
Coordinating Structures in Russia-Ukraine Conflict Blogosphere

- Blogs were identified using TweetTracker, an online tool developed by Arizona State University, by finding the sites that have been tweeted and retweeted the most during the conflict and have propaganda messages.
- Those sites are manually classified as blogs or non-blogs.
- Blogs are then further subdivided into categories of:
  - Ukraine focused blogs
  - News blogs
  - Non-Ukraine focused blogs.
- Web Content Extractor, or WCE, is used to crawl through each of the identified sites.
- We obtained 18,000 blog posts from 26 different blog sites.

A tiny sample of blog network for Russia-Ukraine conflict.

- **Nodes** represent blogs and **Edges** represent link between blogs (out-links).
- The structure with **blue nodes** is identified as a focal/coordinating structure.
- Although RT.COM is the most central node, the triad “**Graham Phillips – Russian News Agency – Voice of Russia**” is a more influential coordinating structure for information dissemination.
Case Study 2: The 2015 Trident Juncture Exercise

We identified the most influential posts using Blogtrackers that happened to have a lot of propaganda and a clear call for civil unrest against NATO forces.

The most influential post is written in **Italian language**. We used Google Translation service to find the post to be highly propaganda-riddled.
AGITPROP - Astroturfing

Camp program: TODAY October 11, 2015 EVENT Antimilitarist TO 18 IN CAGLIARI. CONCENTRATION PIAZZA D’ARMI. THE CAMP IS LOCATED IN THE FORMER QUARRY OF MONTE URPINU (NEAR THE URBAN GARDENS) VIA RAFFA GARZIA. For visitors REMAINS THE APPOINTMENT this morning on October 9, 10.30 AM IN PIAZZA DEL CARMINE. Friday, October 9: From 9 to 11 reception in the square of the Carmine - the opening of the camp in the former quarry at Monte Urpinu - afternoon initiatives in the city ‘21.00 dinner - Assembly of the camp Saturday, October 10 9.30 meeting on the prospects for anti-militarist struggle and against the trident juncture - PRESENTATION OF THE NEW CALENDAR OF EXERCISES IN SARDINIA following dinner Sunday, October 11 Morning conclusive Assembly Afternoon parade. The program potra 'vary due to weather issues, because of the cops or contingency. PORT TENT, SLEEPING BAG, FLAT AND SERVERS. THE LOCATION OF THE CAMP WILL PUBLISHED TOMORROW MORNING, THEN Meet RECEPTION II CAMPING Antimilitarist FIGHT - AROUND CAGLIARI 9-10-11 October 2015 Out of the mobilization against the Capo Frasca polygon of 13 September 2016, initiatives and actions directed against the military presence in Sardinia have multiplied and diversified to try and jam the mechanism of the war. Cuts of networks, slowing the means and blocking exercises have taken the “necessary severity” to the conduct of military activities. Thanks to its experience and in the wake of the procession of 11 June 2015 in Decimomannu, as No Bases Network here or elsewhere we decided to call for the second weekend of October an anti-militarist struggle camping. These three days they want to continue and refine the forms of struggle practised until now, with the aim of sabotaging the military and everything revolves around us. For this we would like active participation and contribution by all and all, then it can be a starting point for a reproducibility of the practices in their contexts and territories. The campground also wants to act as a springboard for international mobilization, called for the second half of October, against the exercise Trident Juncture 2015. With this exercise, NATO intends to test its intervention force in the short term, to prepare for the increasingly Possible conflict on Middle East fronts, North African and Russian. 36000 men, hundreds of vehicles, aircraft and ships will fire in Sardinia, Sicily, Spain and Portugal. For this exercise, the largest since 2002, NATO once again a tribute in terms of pollution, resource exploitation and militarization of the territories to train for war. As it has been for the exercises of Aries brigade, the brigade of Aosta and STAREX, we can not make ourselves complicit in all of this, do not let them rest assured. Proposal mobilization against the Trident Download INFORMATION MEMORANDUM ON TRIDENT Juncture 2015.

As it has been for the exercises of Aries brigade, the brigade of Aosta and STAREX, we can not make ourselves complicit in all of this, do not let them rest assured.

NATO once again a tribute in terms of pollution, resource exploitation and militarization of the territories to train for war.

For this we would like active participation and contribution by all and all, then it can be a starting point for a reproducibility of the practices in their contexts and territories. The campground also wants to act as a springboard for international mobilization, called for the second half of October, against the exercise Trident Juncture 2015.
Case Study 3: The 2016 Anakonda Exercise

The post mocks and ridicules the exercise, by comparing it with the Nicki Minaj’s raunchy music video titled “anaconda”. Here are some excerpts: "This raises the question of what buns the NATO make so hot that they can get out the Anaconda" "using its forked tongue" "A fine example of cross-media-fuck" and many others.
Most influential blog during Anakonda 2016 exercise period was marucha.wordpress.com.

- The blog is ridiculing Polish government’s policy on accepting refugees.
- And further calls US Army participation in Anakonda exercise as INVASION.

---

**Judeo-Ukrainian T.Sakiewicz Organizes More In "Imieniu Polish Community" In The Adventurous Washington said**

2016-06-06 (Monday) @ 8:29:46 p.m.

the so-called. "Polish newspaper club" in Washington CONTRACT Judeo-Ukrainian T.Sakiewiczka banderowska hired by the secret police and the CIA organized Jewish propaganda roundup UKROW Polish speakers living in the US, so that you may gather June 11, 2016, in Washington pm. 14:30 to 16:00 before the Jewish Melina "white house" and its manifestation of "supported" ALLEGEDLY on behalf "of the entire Polish community" INVASION 14 thousand soldiers -zabijaków US Army on Poland!

Look here:

Typical Characteristics - Disinformation riddled blogs

- Effectiveness of each of the 8 criteria in identifying misinformation-riddled blog.
- The criteria are sorted in decreasing order of effectiveness.
- The smaller the gray bar the more effective the criterion is.
- Numbers on the colored bars indicate the number of blog sites identified as containing misinformation with a confidence of High, Medium, and Low.
Tracking the origins of the content on these blogs

**Pattern 1:** Reverse Image Search - The images were not unique for each article and not relevant with the context it was used for. The same image was reused with different narratives.

**Pattern 2:** The use of hashtags and links in blog posts serve as the vehicle connecting other social media channels.
Mix Media and Cross Media Dissemination Approaches

- Mix media information dissemination campaign refers to the use of multiple social media channels to diffuse a narrative.
- More precisely, the information campaign can be observed on multiple social media sites with text, images, audio and video content.
- The content may not be identical on the various social media channels, but it pertains to a particular information campaign.

- A cross-media information dissemination campaign orchestrates the use of specific media channels.
- More precisely, the information is hosted on a website (e.g., a blog site, video on a YouTube channel) and is widely distributed through other social media channels that provide established social network structures, such as Twitter, Facebook, etc.
Disinformation Campaign Coordination

• The above figure is a network of blogsites and shared hyperlinks.
• The network contains 21 blogs (red nodes) and 2321 hyperlinks (blue nodes).
• Size of a node is proportional to the number of shared hyperlinks (i.e., out-degree centrality).
• Edge thickness is proportional to the number of times a blogsite shared a hyperlink.

• The above figure is a network of blogs based on commonly shared hyperlinks.
• The network is fully connected, i.e., a clique, where every blog is connected with every other blog.
• This depicts massively coordinated information campaign.
Botnet evolution and role in disinformation dissemination

Examining the Use of Botnets and their Evolution in Propaganda Dissemination
Concluding Thoughts

• There are many studies examining Twitter, Facebook, and the likes but not the blogosphere.

• Blogosphere is a good place for possibly bad citizen journalism.

• The rogue side of citizen journalism can include misinformation, agitation and propaganda, content mocking, biased or offensive contents, etc.

• We need to help develop countermeasures to stem the tide of fakery.

• Regulation is a step forward but smarter algorithms and stronger media literacy are the long term solutions.
Acknowledgments

• This research is funded in part by:
  • The U.S. Office of Naval Research (ONR) (N000141010091, N000141410489, N0001415P1187, N000141612016, and N000141612412).
  • The U.S. Army Research Office (ARO) (W911NF-16-1-0189).
  • The U.S. Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency (DARPA) (W31P4Q-17-C-0059).
  • The U.S. National Science Foundation (NSF) (IS-1636933, IIS-1110868 and ACI-1429160).
  • The U.S. Air Force Research Lab (AFRL).
  • The Jerry L. Maulden/Entergy Fund at the University of Arkansas at Little Rock.
Thank You!

Dr. Serpil Tokdemir Yuce serpil.yuce@omig.arkansas.gov
Prof. Dr. Stephan Böhm stephan.boehm@hs-rm.de
Prof. Dr. Nitin Agarwal nxagarwal@ualr.edu