



## Mechanics of Misinformation: What? How? Why?

Nitin Agarwal, Ph.D. (nxagarwal@ualr.edu) Maulden-Entergy Chair and Distinguished Professor Director, COSMOS Research Center University of Arkansas – Little Rock





- Director, Collaboratorium for Social Media and Online Behavioral Studies (COSMOS)
- Jerry L. Maulden-Entergy Endowed Chair & Distinguished Professor of Information Science, University of Arkansas – Little Rock
- Research expertise: cyber social behaviors, mis/disinformation analysis, smart health, AI, social computing
- Leading projects with a combined funding of over \$20 million from U.S. federal agencies including Department of Defense, DARPA, Department of State, National Science Foundation, Department of Homeland Security.
- Published 10 books and over 200 with several best paper awards and nominations.
- Developed publicly available social media analysis tools (bTracker and vTracker), assisting NATO, European Defense agencies, Australian DoD, Singapore government, Arkansas Attorney General's office, among others. Technologies are listed under National Tech Innovation Hub launched by the U.S. Department of State to defeat foreign based propaganda.
- Covered by local, national, and international media including Bloomberg, US News, KUAR, Arkansas Business, Arkansas Times, Arkansas Democrat Gazette, and many others.
- Spoke at over 100 public and professional, national and international forums such as the NATO, DARPA, US Department of State, US Department of Defense, US Pentagon, US National Academies of Sciences Engineering and Medicine, US Office of the Director of National Intelligence, Facebook Asia Pacific HQ, Twitter Asia Pacific HQ, US Embassy in Singapore, Singapore Ministry of Communication and Information, USIP, among others.
- Fellow of IARIA, AAoC, ARA
- Received University-wide Faculty Excellence Award in Research and Creative Endeavors in 2015 and 2021, Visionary Arkansan, Top 20 in their 20ies, best social media educator, and several other awards.



Dr. Nitin Agarwal http://cosmos.ualr.edu/ nxagarwal@ualr.edu



ROCK

SOTICS 2021

3

### Collaboratorium for Social Media and Online Behavioral Studies

COSMOS

COSMOS is developing big data analytical tools to understand digital behaviors and forecast trends to achieve social good. With multi-year multi-million dollar funding from various federal and state agencies, COSMOS is able to bring together several international academic, industry, and government institutions as partners in this venture.





@cosmographers

https://cosmos.ualr.edu/





26 grants (total funding over \$45 million and \$10 million to COSMOS-UALR):

- Army Research Office
- Office of Naval Research
- Air Force Research Lab
- DARPA
- Department of State
- Department of Homeland Security
- National Science Foundation
- NATO
- Arkansas Research Alliance
- Jerry L. Maulden/Entergy Endowment







- Over 30 members
  - Undergraduate students,
  - Graduate students (MS, PHD)
  - Postdoctoral fellows
  - Administrative staff
- Over 20 graduated
  - Industry (Walmart, Acxiom, FirstOrion, Windstream, Dillard, Amazon, LinkedIn, HP, Cisco)
  - Academia
  - Pursuing higher education





@cosmographers https://cosmos.ualr.edu/





#### Academics

Arizona State University, Carnegie Mellon University, Creighton University, Emory University, University of Central Oklahoma, University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill, George Mason University, George Washington University, University of Pittsburgh, Penn State, University of Memphis, University of New Haven, University of Hawaii, University of Michigan, University of Southern California, West Virginia University, Vilnius University, National University of Singapore, University of Sydney

#### Industry

Atlantic Council (DFRLab), Wal-Mart Inc., LinkedIn, Intelligent Automation Inc., Charles River Analytics, Galisteo Consulting Inc., CarleyTech, Netanomics, Kairos Inc., Bond.AI (fintech)

#### Government

 AR Attorney General's Office, US Defense Agencies, US ARCENT, EUCOM, US Cyber Command, Naval Postgraduate School, US SPAWAR, US Joint Information Operations Warfare Center, III-Marine Expeditionary Force (III-MEF), Army Research Lab, Office of Naval Research (Global), Air Force Research Lab, Singapore Government, Canadian PMO, NATO, StratCom COE, European Defense Agencies, FVEYS – intelligence coalition





Machine

Data

- Smart Health and Al
- Campaigns and Movements
- Deviant Behaviors
- Social Cybersecurity





# **Campaigns and Movements**





Flash Mobs in Public Places



Saudi Women's Right to Drive protest



Autism Awareness Campaign



Starbucks Racial Controversy



2011 Arab Spring Social Movement





### NSF and DoD funded projects (over \$1,000,000) on advancing understanding of cyber-collective actions









Weaponizing Narratives



Deviant Hackers Networks (DHNs)



ISIS Recruitment Radicalization Propaganda



Anti NATO Propaganda





Anti-West Narrative

Fake News

Several multi-year DoD funded studies totaling over \$10 million



















Agarwal, Nitin





- Tracking anti-West, anti-EU, anti-NATO propaganda and influence campaigns
- Participated in various NATO exercises to assist public affairs in social media monitoring



- Study terrorist and hacker groups
- Study 2019 Canadian Elections
- Monitor disinformation campaigns in the Asia Pacific region (Singapore Ministry of Communication and Information, Australian DoD, Univ. of Sydney)
- Monitor COVID-19 disinformation campaigns (FVEYS intelligence coalition, Arkansas Attorney General office)



## **Social Media and Influence Operations**



- Key coordinating pro-Russian actors during Ukraine-Russia conflict (Crimean annexation)
- A sample of blog network for Russia-Ukraine conflict containing 18,000 blog posts from 26 blogs.
- **Nodes** represent blogs and **Edges** represent link between blogs (out-links).
- The structure with **blue nodes** is identified as a focal/coordinating structure.
- Although RT.COM is the most central node, the triad "Graham Phillips – Russian News Agency – Voice of Russia " is a more influential coordinating structure for information dissemination.



Published in SNAM 2016



## **Social Media and Influence Operations**



- Graham W. Phillips is a British journalist and blogger.
- He went to Ukraine to cover the voice of Ukrainians during Euromaidan.
- He reported that Ukrainians are "happy" with the previous pro-Russian government of Ukraine.
- He used Vlogging to cover the events.
- His Vlogs made him an influential blogger & an enemy to the current Ukrainian government so they banned him from entering Ukraine for three years.
- Once he was banned from entering Ukraine he went to Russia instead of going back to England.

### How A British Blogger Became An Unlikely Star Of The Ukraine Conflict — And Russia Today











### UA LITTLE ROCK

# **Terrorist and Hacker Networks**



**ISIS Recruitment Network** 

k Black Hat Hacker Network



DIGITAL FORENSICS, SECURITY AND LAW

Journal of Digital Forensics, Security and Law

Volume 11 | Number 2

#### 2016

### Exploring Deviant Hacker Networks (DHM) on Social Media Platforms

Samer Al-khateeb University of Arkansas, Little Rock

Kevin J. Conlan University of New Haven

Nitin Agarwal University of Arkansas, Little Rock

Jet Soist International Conference on Design and Construction of Smart City Components (RCSmartCites) December 17-19th, 2019, Caive, Egget Using Computational Social Science Techniques to Identify Coordinated Cyber Threats to Smart City Networks

Article 1

Mustafa Alassad<sup>1</sup>, Billy Spann<sup>1</sup>, Samer Al-khateeb<sup>2</sup>, Nitin Agarwal<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>University of Arkansas, Little Rock, AR, USA {mmalassad, bxspann, nxagarwal}@ualr.edu <sup>2</sup>Creighton University, Omaha, NE, USA SamerAl-Khateebl@creighton.edu

Abstract

10

13 14

15 16 17

> 18 19

20 21 22

23

28

29

30 31 Smart cities are increasingly fixing cyber-attacks due to the endeavors they have made in technological advancements. The challenge for smart cities, that utilize complex digital networks to manage city systems and services, is that any device that relies on internet connectivity to function is a potential cyber-attack victim. Smart cities use smart sensors. Online Social Networks (OSN) act as human sensors offering significant combinitions to the amount of data asset of a smart cities. OSNs can also be used as a coordination and amplification platform for attacks. For instance, aggressors can increase the impact of an attack by causing panic in an area by proceeding attacks using OSNs. Public data can help aggressors to determine the best timing for attacks, scheduling attacks, and then using OSNs to coordinate attacks on smart city infrastructure. This convergence capabilities that enable cites to look beyond internal data and identify threats based on active events. Assessment of powerful actors using DCFM detection methods can help aggressor identify advance and and the transle cites to look beyond internal data and identify threats based on active event attacks. Corons of powerful hackers can b eldentified through FSM which is a model that the provent attacks. Corons of powerful hackers can b eldentified through FSM which is a model that the provent attacks. Corons of powerful hackers can be identified through FSM which is a model that the provent attacks. Corons of powerful hackers can be identified through FSM which is a model that the provent attacks. Corons of powerful hackers can be identified through FSM which is a model that the provent attacks. Torons of powerful hackers can be identified through FSM which is a model that the provent attacks. Torons of powerful hackers can be identified through FSM which is a model that the provent attack. Torons of powerful hackers can be identified through FSM which is a model that the provent attack. Torons of powerful hackers can be identifie



COSMOS

sustainable Gvil Infrastructures Moustafa Baraka - Syed M. Ahme Amin Akhnoukh - Mona B. A<del>nwa</del> Mahmoud El Khafif - Nagy Hanna Amr T. Abdel Hamid - *Editors* 

Design and

of Smart Cities

SS GE

Construction

## UA Terrorist and Hacker Networks





### **Terrorist Networks and Focal Structures**



Algebraic transformation of the model to identify key network groups coordinating deviant acts grounded in **Collective Action theory**. (Alassad, Agarwal et al., 2020) Journal of Information Processing and Management, Elsevier



ISIS recruitment network (hub and spoke) After ISIS recruitment network disintegrates

ROCK

# **Computational Propaganda Tactics**

- Cross platform orchestration
  - Growing use of niche platforms
- Communities and coordination
  - Flash mob style coordination
  - Blogger communities
  - Coordinated clickbait (a.k.a. blog farms, information laundering)
  - Computational (AI) propaganda coordinated *deepfakes*
- Algorithmic manipulation
  - Machine driven communications (MADCOMs) (bots, botnets, social bots, etc.)







### **Canadian Federal Elections 2019**



#### Coordinated *deepfakes*

One such fake website "weresorryindia.com" amplified anti-Trudeau narrative suggesting he is not a friend of the Canadian-Indian community. The website tops the results in search engines.





Weresonvindia : We're Sonv India - The Rebel worth of \$ 8.95 and have a daily income of around

#### Indeau Sparks Outrage with Bizarre Bollywood-Themed Mbs /Regalinsurrection.com + 2018/02 + trudeau-sparks-outrage-with-biza vo 24, 2018 - PUTANE SIGN THE WRITE of accesso for the Canadian Prime Me in India: http://www.WereSorryIndia.com Line Jun | Pelinuary 24

Ezra Levant: We're Sorry, India, for Justin Trudeau's Behavior anamerica adstreevideos.com - News - Canadian -vo 22, 2011 - WareSomyhdia.com Ecra Locart of TheRe issue durt theix all Canadians are like Justin Trudeou and

Finally... crooked Justin... lock him up! | well WELL WELL . https://www.pinterest.com > pin + SCA HERE Http://www.WanaGorryIndia.com Ezra Levant of TheRebet India -- please don't think all Canadians are like Justin Trudeau and



embarrassment EZRA LEVAN





and his family and friends. We're not.





- for the 21st Century (PDE, 326 KID) Katrin Kania Galeano, LTC Rick Galeano, Esther Mead, Billy Spann, Joseph Kready, and
- Nitin Agarwai: The Role of YouTube during the 2019 Canadian Federal Elec Method Analysis of Online Discourse and Information Actors (PDF, 8.7 MB)
- August Cole and P.W. Singer: Thinking The Unthinkable With Useful Fiction (PDF, 383 K8) Suzanne Waldman and Major Marshall Erickson: Strategic Communication in the Prese and Future Military Enterprise (PDF, 392 KB)
- · Colonel (Retired) Bernd Horn: The End of 'The Golden Age Of SOF? Is There a Role for Special ces in the Renewed 'Great Power Competition? (PDF, 569 KB)

For further information please contact the editor of the Journal of Future Conflict, Anthony Seaboyer at Anthony.seaboyer@rmc.ca.





### Algorithmic Manipulation – TRJE 2018











Explainability



#### IRA Twitter bot data released by US Intelligence Agencies







# **Platform Vulnerability/Bias**

- AI-based recommendation algorithms that predict our shopping behaviors, books and articles to read, videos to watch lack transparency.
- Recommendation algorithm learns from behavioral data and perpetuates the underlying bias in its recommendations.
  - YouTube's recommendation algorithm is known to push its viewers down the conspiratorial rabbit hole by suggesting related videos.
  - On Facebook, ads to recruit delivery drivers for Domino's Pizza Inc. were disproportionately shown to men, while women were more likely to receive notices in recruiting shoppers for grocery-delivery service Instacart Inc.
  - Explainable model could help in identifying causes of biased recommendations thereby enhancing the model's transparency.





# **Platform Vulnerability/Bias**



Computational propaganda tactics on YouTube detected using a groundbreaking multimedia processing approach based on color theory. Research received <u>Best Paper</u> award at the International Conference on Human and Social Analytics (HUSO), Oct.18-22,2020

Video ID: OMSvaF2kzPA Title: China vs US The War in the South China Sea already Start Channel: Breaking News TV



Video ID: GsCmudyXY2o Title: China vs US The War in the South China Sea already Start Channel: DOT COM US



Similar videos detected on different YouTube channels using barcode approach. Below, network of channels identified deploying crowd amplification tactic.



Crowd amplification tactic successfully manipulated YouTube's search results. "Hot News" - a prominent channel disseminating anti-US videos related "South China Sea" conflict – shows up at top of the search results.



Ave
 Product Prologonie Namy drips and altergatile (2) warding in Doub Drive Des
 [phon]
 Total Tradem Of Avery Tradem ave



Are
 (prift) then the Eurlinear's has it to Property for the War is the South
 Original
 European start to
 The South Area and Philippines' President Duty's Table Charles's Lay OF
 Table Area





Video barcode technique allows us to navigate interesting narrative elements for a collection of videos pertaining to an event (above) or a single video (below)



### Virality over veracity!



# How to observe, identify, and measure algorithmic bias?



Fig. 1. Distribution of PageRank values in the recommendation graphs 1 (left) and 2 (right). We observe similar results in all recommendation graphs. The count of videos is represented in log scale on the y-axis.



Fig. 2. Complementary Cumulative Distribution Function (CCDF) Plots of PageRank Scores in each Recommendation Graphs 1(left) and 2 (right).

Topic drift and decrease in relevance was observed.



Top PageRank videos were removed weeks or months after their appearance in the recommendation network. Reason for content removal is violation of platform terms and services.



## From Cyber to Real-world Mobs









#### Human and Social Analytics 2020 – Best Paper

HUSO 2020 : The Sixth International Conference on Human and Social Analytics

#### YouTube Video Categorization Using Moviebarcode

Recep Erol, Rick Rejeleene, Richard Young, Thomas Marcoux, Muhammad Nihal Hussain, and Nitin Agarwal Collaboratorium for Social Media and Online Behavioral Studies (COSMOS). University of Arkansas at Little Rock, Little Rock, Arkansas, USA {rxerol, rrejeleene, rbyoung, txmarcoux, mnhussain, nxagarwal}@ualr.edu

Alonaci—Every minite more than five-handred hours of vides constant is uploaded to YuoTabe, and we can only expert this minite to increase. Although YuoTabe is the most proputor video sharing website, stilling conducted on this platform ary provide of fictive video analysis technique proputor video sharing website, stilling conducted on this platform and providenced on this platform. Due to this, research conducted of movidenced on a forencie video manipus (technique for system stickally categorizing YuoTabe video. Yuo Sun and Yuo Sun and Yuo assatilities of movidenced as a forencie technique for system scickally categorizing Yuo Tabe video. Yuo Sun and Yuo assatifies of movidenced as a forencie technique for system scickally categorizing Yuo Tabe video. Yuo Sun and Yuo Sun and Yuo assatifies of movidenced as a forencie technique for system scickally categorizing Yuo Tabe video. Yuo Sun and Yuo angle image 157. The result of this technique is a single single image 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this technique is a single single intrage 157. The result of this techni

video and extract insightful knowledge efficiently. In addition



## **Mining Parler Data**





#### Over 70 Terabytes of data















### **Tracking COVID-19 Misinformation**



COVID-19 misinfodemic presents an example of emerging cyber-social threats. While there are similarities with other disinformation campaigns (e.g., anti-NATO, anti-US, anti-EU, anti-West in Indo-Pacific region), COVID-19 disinformation campaigns have their nuances such as global and regional narratives; high topical diversity (health, policy, religion, geopolitical affairs, etc.); high volume, velocity, veracity, and variety of false narratives. COVID-19 misinformation tracker tool developed in collaboration with the <u>Arkansas Office of the Attorney General</u> to support detection, investigation, and mitigation of cross-platform COVID-19 disinformation campaigns and scams to assist policy makers. Our efforts demonstrate that when researchers coordinate with policy makers it can make a difference, especially when that coordination remains an ongoing process.



https://cosmos.ualr.edu/covid-19



### **Tracking COVID-19 Misinformation**







# **Modeling Misinfodemic**

How misinformation spreads? Leveraging epidemiological model. (Maleki, Agarwal, et al. 2021) European Conference of Operations Research (EURO) 2021

de



ROCK

- S: Susceptible
- E: Exposed
- I: Infected
- Z: Skeptic

$$\frac{dS}{dt} = -\beta S \frac{I}{N} - bS \frac{Z}{N}$$

$$\frac{dE}{dt} = (1-p)\beta S \frac{I}{N} + (1-l)bS \frac{Z}{N} - \rho E \frac{I}{N} - \varepsilon E$$

$$\frac{dI}{dt} = p\beta S \frac{I}{N} + \rho E \frac{I}{N} + \varepsilon E$$

$$\frac{dZ}{dt} = lbS \frac{Z}{N}$$

| Parameter    | DEFINITION  |
|--------------|---|
| β            | Contact rate between S and I.                             |
| b            | Contact rate between S and Z.                             |
| ρ            | Contact rate between E and I.                             |
| р            | Probability of S to I given contact with I.               |
| 1 <b>-</b> p | Probability of S to $\underline{E}$ given contact with I. |
| з            | Transition rate of E to I (Incubation rate).              |
| 1            | Probability of S to Z given contact with Z.               |
| 1-1          | Probability of S to $\underline{E}$ given contact with Z. |



Misinformation regarding the unrest in Washington, D.C. in March 2020 propagated using the #DCblackout hashtag

Error = 0.019





Data collected during the effort led to development of predictive behavioral models to assist policymaking and crisis communications. Two examples are shown below.



COVID-19 misinformation themes pushed on multiple platforms (blogs, twitter, YouTube, facebook, and other non-mainstream social media platforms). Recurring/periodic themes such as vaccine hesitancy, alternate medicines, conspiracy theories, etc. allow <u>proactive communication strategies and</u> policymaking to detect and mitigate emerging cyber-social threats.



Taxicity analysis on YouTube commenters. Taxic discourse causes disruption and polarization/segregation among communities, as seen above. We demonstrate that by removing highly taxic users from a network, hate speech reduces, online discourse improves, and fractured communities heal. Our findings offer guidance to policymakers within each online social network to make informed decisions about the information environment and derive appropriate and timely countermeasures to continue providing a healthy platform for their users.

Working with LinkedIn and Arkansas Office of the Attorney General



### **Tracking COVID-19 Misinformation**





### Michigan anti-lockdown protests communication network

- Michigan lockdown protest Twitter data (hashtags: #LetMiPeopleGo, #MiLeg, #Endthelockdown, #MichiganProtest)
  - April 1 to May 20
  - 16,383 Tweets
- Anti-lockdown communication network in Michigan
  - 3,632 nodes
  - 382 groups (focused on 5 most powerful groups)
- FSA/DCFM model showed powerful coordination among far-right twitter groups including QAnon calling for protest and actions against Gov. Whitmer as compared to far-left groups. FBI later unraveled a far-right wing plot to kidnap Gov. Whitmer.





Over 150 GB of data every day consisting of text, images, audio, video, networks, and metadata



Multi-threaded, distributed, resilient, and scalable data collection framework has been developed, evaluated, and deployed.



Dashboard



# **Data Collection & Processing**



- Anti-Vaccination discourse
- COVID-19 misinformation
- Indo-Pacific influence campaigns
- NATO's 2015 2019 Military Exercises (Trident Juncture, Brilliant Jump, Anakonda, Baltic Operations)
- Canadian 2019 Prime Ministerial Elections
- US 2016 Presidential Elections (e.g., IRA social bot data)
- Migrant crisis (European Union)
- Ukraine and Russia conflict (Euromaidan, Crimean annexation)
- Ukrainian political affairs
- Balkan political affairs
- Venezuelan socio-political crisis

- Blogs
  - 27 attributes
  - 14,854 blog sites, 3,243,408 posts, and 13,794,757 comments
- Twitter
  - 24 attributes
  - 281,546,290 tweets and 42,624,095 users
- YouTube
  - 60 attributes
  - 9,778 channels, 440,950 videos, 160,638,256 comments, 107,551,703 likes/dislikes/views, and 11,563,003 related videos
- Alternate platforms
  - BitChute, Parler, Rumble, Gab, etc.
  - 24 attributes
  - 2,723,790 posts and 38,490,624 views/likes

### UA Technologies Developed





Blogtrackers btracker.host.ualr.edu/

YouTubeTracker vtracker.host.ualr.edu/

### Selected in US Department of State Global Engagement Center's Tech Innovation program

SOTICS 2021

### Social Media Training Course

- III-Marines Expeditionary Force Information Group (III-MIG). July 2020
- NATO Strategic Communications Center of Excellence. 25-29 March 2019. Latvia
- Marine Expeditionary Forces (2MEF). 28-31 August 2018 at CMU, Pittsburgh.
- NATO Strategic Communications Center of Excellence. 20-25 March 2017. Latvia.
- US CyberCommand's CyberSchool, 3-6 August 2016. Ft. McNair



## Social Cyber Security Working Group



- Supported by NSF Big Data program
- Over 50 member institutions worldwide including researchers, policy makers, journalists, cyber security professionals
- Outcomes of the working group include
  - Policy briefs laying out the research agenda
  - Collective catalog of resources to spark innovation among researchers





### Social Computing Conference, Washington D.C.



- Social Computing, Behavioral-Cultural Modeling and Prediction Conference, Washington D.C., July 6-9, 2021. (over 200 participants)
- Supported by several federal funding agencies.
- http://sbp-brims.org/











- Develop publicly available technologies and solutions
- Social media companies need to be more proactive, <u>Algotransparency.org</u>
- Emerging technologies like blockchain for content validation, decentralized social media platforms
- Build collaborative networks of practitioners, researchers, policy makers to address this problem together
- Strengthen media literacy programs
- Need to advance the dialog on cyber diplomacy





#### Nitin Agarwal, nxagarwal@ualr.edu

COSMOS Tools Developed:

- COVID-19 https://cosmos.ualr.edu/covid-19
- Blogtrackers https://btracker.host.ualr.edu/
- YouTubeTracker https://vtracker.host.ualr.edu/
- Focal Structure Analysis http://fsa.host.ualr.edu/

### **Blogtrackers**





### https://cosmos.ualr.edu/

Follow cosmographers on





#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research is funded in part by the U.S. National Science Foundation (OIA-1946391, OIA-1920920, IIS-1636933, ACI-1429160, and IIS-1110868), U.S. Office of Naval Research (N00014-10-1-0091, N00014-14-1-0489, N00014-15-P-1187, N00014-16-1-2016, N00014-16-1-2412, N00014-17-1-2675, N00014-17-1-2605, N68335-19-C-0359, N00014-19-1-2336, N68335-20-C-0540, N00014-21-1-2121), U.S. Air Force Research Lab, U.S. Army Research Office (W911NF-20-1-0262, W911NF-16-1-0189), U.S. Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency (W31P4Q-17-C-0059), Arkansas Research Alliance, the Jerry L. Maulden/Entergy Endowment at the University of Arkansas at Little Rock, and the Australian Department of Defense Strategic Policy Grants Program (SPGP) (award number: 2020-106-094). Any opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this material are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the funding organizations. The researchers gratefully acknowledge the support.





